No Student, Educator, Department, or Institution is an Island: How to Implement and Integrate Holistic Reform Using Spectrum Thinking

Alexandros M. Goudas
Associate Professor of English
MDEC President Emeritus
Delta College, Michigan
GADE Conference Keynote, 8 Feb 2018
King and Prince Hotel, St. Simons Island, GA
communitycollegedata.com @ccollegedata
Welcome!

• Thank you for having me! I started my career at Darton College and a GADE conference!

• You are very important people; you have an exponential effect on the lives of thousands of students, the economy, the country, and the world

• communitycollegedata.com and @ccollegedata

• We should start with some positive data

• You need to know that you are already making a difference:
More Good News

• So overall 4-year grad rates are on the rise
• Moreover, the National Student Clearinghouse Research Center (2017) recently reported updated graduation rates for two-year public colleges
• Overall graduation rates after tracking for 6 years is about 38%
• Follow these students for two more years, and the certificate and degree completion rate is 44%
The Problem

• However, on the other side of this, we do have a chronic problem in higher education

• Even top-performing at-risk students graduate at a lower rate when compared to other top-performers

• Let’s look at one of the most revealing charts that demonstrates this (13-year tracking study), and a Pell Institute report as well:
“Graduation Gap Wider Than Enrollment Gap”

Figure 5. Percentage of spring 2002 high school sophomores who earned a bachelor’s degree or higher by 2012, by socioeconomic status (SES) and mathematics achievement quartile in 2002.

NOTE: Students’ SES is based on their parents’ education and occupations as well as the family income in 2002 and is measured by a composite score on these variables. The “low” SES group is the lowest quartile; the “middle” SES group is the middle two quartiles; and the “high” SES group is the upper quartile. Mathematics achievement quartiles reflect students’ scores on assessments conducted in 2002.

When will the U.S. close the gap in higher education attainment by family income?
Equity Indicator 5a: Estimated bachelor's degree attainment rate by age 24 for dependent family members by family income quartile: 1970 to 2015
But We Know What Works!

• Despite this, it turns out that we know a great deal about reforms that work for at-risk students.
• Our goal now should be to begin to implement them thoughtfully and holistically, using data to guide us.
• Let’s first explore what holistic reform can look like.
• This example actually moves the needle in a meaningful way:
We Know What Works: Holistic Reform

• City University of New York (CUNY) Accelerated Study in Associate Programs (ASAP)\textsuperscript{5,6}

• The ASAP program implemented a randomized, controlled study, and the intervention was a comprehensive overhaul of Dev Ed (and non-Dev Ed), including the infusion of a great deal of design reform, staffing, and resources ($4,000 to $6,800 per student per year)
We Know What Works: Holistic Reform

• ASAP Components
  • Dev Ed courses first
  • Full time requirement
  • Block scheduling
  • Learning communities for first year
  • Group advising sessions every week (60-80 caseload)
  • Meetings with adviser at least twice per month
  • Mandatory tutoring
  • Career specialist meeting once per semester
We Know What Works: Holistic Reform

• ASAP Components
  • Tuition waiver
  • Free MetroCards ($2.75 one-way trip NYC)
  • Free books
  • Free social events
  • Consistent and repeated messages
• Out of pocket costs for institution are again about $5K-$7K more per student per year
• Good model for “free community college”
We Know What Works: Holistic Reform

• Dev Ed ASAP n (numbers) and demographics:
  • 896 students in original total sample
  • 44% Hispanic, 34% Black, 10% White, 8% Asian

• Credits and retention results:
  • Increased credits over control group by 25%
  • Increased retention second semester (80 to 90%)
We Know What Works: Holistic Reform

• Dev Ed ASAP graduation rates after 3 years:
  • Control Group (no ASAP): 21%
  • ASAP Intervention Group: 48%
We Know What Works: Holistic Reform

• Non Dev Ed ASAP graduation rates after 3 years:
  • Control Group (no ASAP): 29%
  • ASAP Intervention Group: 60%

• Three community colleges in Ohio are starting this program; others looking into it
• Many of you already use some of these components!
Applying Spectrum Thinking

• But what if we don’t have enough money?
• This is the most important issue at hand: How can we implement reforms that work if we have limited budgets and reduced staffing?
• I propose a philosophical approach that helps people start to think systematically
• It will move you toward integrated, holistic reform
Applying Spectrum Thinking

• I argue we should use **Spectrum Thinking**
• It is a philosophical and practical approach to leadership (decision-making)—and you all are leaders—for implementing connected, holistic reform
• Here is a more in-depth definition, and we will look at several examples of it afterward:
Applying Spectrum Thinking

What is *Spectrum Thinking*?
It is a process to identify effective reforms; assess them according to research and institutional resources; place them on a spectrum; and move toward implementing as many of them as possible in a way that supports existing initiatives and integrates them with new ones.
Applying Spectrum Thinking

• The process of applying of Spectrum Thinking:
  • Find the components that work (see research)
  • Ask: What are we already doing well now?
  • Ask: What components can we add in a thoughtful and well-supported way?
  • Put these components on a spectrum (we will discuss different kinds of spectrums soon)
  • Integrate new initiatives with existing ones
  • Our goal is always integrated, holistic reform, one step at a time; now let’s apply this to ASAP:
Applying Spectrum Thinking: ASAP

SPECTRUM OF PIECEMEAL TO HOLISTIC: ALL COMPONENTS EQUAL

Holistic and Integrated  Piecemeal

- 90%
- 80%
- 70%
- 60%
- 50%
- 40%
- 30%
- 20%
Applying Spectrum Thinking: ASAP

SPECTRUM OF PIECEMEAL TO HOLISTIC: ALL COMPONENTS EQUAL

Holistic and Integrated

Piecemeal

90% 80% 70% 60% 50% 40% 30% 20%
Applying Spectrum Thinking: ASAP

SPECTRUM OF PIECEMEAL TO HOLISTIC: ALL COMPONENTS EQUAL

Holistic and Integrated

90% 80% 70% 60% 50% 40% 30% 20%

Piecemeal

Copyright A. Goudas 2018
Applying Spectrum Thinking: Online Education

• Another reform commonly implemented is online education
• How do we do this best? This spectrum is different
• Online education questions to ask at your institution:
  • What are the components that work holistically?
  • What are we doing well now?
  • What components can we integrate in a thoughtful and well-supported way, while still maintaining the quality of the initiatives we are currently running?
Applying Spectrum Thinking: Online Education

A spectrum of online/modular Dev Ed course offerings

(A different kind of spectrum where not all parts are equal)

CLOSE TO STUDENT

Face-to-Face

Hybrid ½ - ½ Or 2/3 1/3

Online Course No Lab (Cost)

Online Course Set Lab Times (Cost)

Online Course Open Lab (Cost)

Online Help Thru College (Free)

Online MOOC Thru Internet (Free)

FAR FROM STUDENT

70% 70% 60% 60% 50% 10% 1% ?%

Online Course (Cost)

Online Help Thru College (Free)

Online MOOC Thru Internet (Free)

Copyright A. Goudas 2018
Applying Spectrum Thinking: Online Education

• A word of caution about fully online courses: Bailey, Jaggars, & Jenkins (2015)\textsuperscript{10} (Guided Pathways book):

“...community colleges are experiencing fiscal pressure and continue to look for ways to lower costs. Yet the ways in which they typically cut spending—by increased reliance on part-time instructors, increased student-teacher ratios, and growing use of fully online instruction—reduce completion rates and likely hurt quality” (p. 197).
Applying Spectrum Thinking: Online Education

• A word of caution about fully online courses: Jaggars (2015) (Washington Post article):

“... many students don’t particularly like online courses. A recent survey of community college students who had taken an online class found that more than 40 percent felt they learned less in online than traditional courses. Only 3 percent thought they learned more. A large percentage of students who had enrolled in online classes reported wishing they could take fewer of them. And community college students are far more likely to withdraw from online classes — in some subjects, up to twice as frequently” (par. 5).
“Navy Officials Examine Training” NPR (2017)

• NPR article on how video training replaced class time:

“It was 2003 when the Navy issued those CDs to junior officers. McGrath and other retired officers say the Navy was trying to save money by doing away with months of classes and making sure crews quickly got to their ships. It borrowed those efficiencies from the business world” (par. 6).
“Navy Officials Examine Training” NPR (2017)

• NPR article on how video training replaced class time:

“So in 2010, just seven years after the CDs were issued, the commander of the Atlantic Fleet, Admiral John Harvey, went to Congress to tell lawmakers it was all a mistake...The Navy increased the classroom time and more time on simulators, but not as much time as they had in the 1970s, which brings us to the present and the recent mishaps, which some officers say are the direct result of those earlier training decisions” (par. 9,14).
Applying Spectrum Thinking: Corequisites

• Another common reform is corequisites (acceleration)
• How do we do this best?
• Corequisite questions to ask at your institution:
  • What are the components that work holistically?
  • What are we doing well now?
  • What components can we integrate in a thoughtful and well-supported way, while still maintaining the quality of the initiatives we are currently running?
Applying Spectrum Thinking: Corequisites

SPECTRUM OF PIECEMEAL TO HOLISTIC: ALL COMPONENTS EQUAL

Holistic and Integrated

90% 80% 70% 60% 50% 40% 30% 20%

Piecemeal

Copyright A. Goudas 2018
Applying Spectrum Thinking: Corequisites

SPECTRUM OF PIECEMEAL TO HOLISTIC: ALL COMPONENTS EQUAL

Holistic and Integrated

Piecemeal

90% 80% 70% 60% 50% 40% 30% 20%
Applying Spectrum Thinking: Corequisites

SPECTRUM OF PIECEMEAL TO HOLISTIC: ALL COMPONENTS EQUAL

Holistic and Integrated

Piecemeal

90%   80%   70%   60%   50%   40%   30%   20%

CONNECT INDIVIDUAL REFORMS AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE

Copyright A. Goudas 2018
Applying Spectrum Thinking: Placement/Intake

• Another common reform is placement/intake
• How do we do this best?
• Placement and intake questions to ask at your institution:
  • What are the components that work holistically?
  • What are we doing well now?
  • What components can we integrate in a thoughtful and well-supported way, while still maintaining the quality of the initiatives we are currently running?
Applying Spectrum Thinking: Placement/Intake

• In order to think about the most important components of a holistic and integrated intake and placement process, we should imagine the ideal first

IMAGINE

What would be your ideal intake and placement process?
Using Spectrum Thinking: Holistic Placement

SPECTRUM OF PIECEMEAL TO HOLISTIC IMPLEMENTATION

Holistic and Integrated    Piecemeal

90%  80%  70%  60%  50%  40%  30%  20%
Using Spectrum Thinking: Holistic Placement

SPECTRUM OF PIECEMEAL TO HOLISTIC IMPLEMENTATION

Holistic and Integrated

90% 80% 70% 60% 50% 40% 30% 20%

Piecemeal
Using Spectrum Thinking: Holistic Placement

SPECTRUM OF PIECEMEAL TO HOLISTIC IMPLEMENTATION

Holistic and Integrated

Piecemeal

90% 80% 70% 60% 50% 40% 30% 20%

CONNECT INDIVIDUAL REFORMS AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE
Applying Spectrum Thinking to Any Reform

What should people do differently starting now?

• Put all the known reforms on a table
• Arrange them in a spectrum of preference, feasibility, and efficacy: the ideal is full and integrated reform
• Then begin move toward full implementation
• Always remember to keep supporting existing initiatives before allocating resources to new reforms
• This is a thoughtful, data-based, holistic implementation process which will improve success

Copyright A. Goudas 2018
Applying Spectrum Thinking to Any Reform

New philosophical approach for implementing reform:

1. Remember to implement reforms *with* support
2. Current effective reforms need *continued* support
3. One of the most important reforms you can do now is to *hire and train more advisers and counselors*
4. Another is to *start integrating existing initiatives*

*Holistic reform is integrated* reform

No one is an island!
Thank you!

Keep up the great work!

References and more reading available at communitycollegedata.com

Follow me on @ccollegedata!